

# SHEFFIELD CITY COUNCIL

## Planning and Highways Committee

### Meeting held 27 August 2019

**PRESENT:** Councillors Peter Rippon (Chair), Jack Clarkson, Tony Damms, Roger Davison, Jayne Dunn, Peter Garbutt, Dianne Hurst, Bob McCann, Zahira Naz, Peter Price, Chris Rosling-Josephs and Andrew Sangar

.....

#### **1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

1.1 An apology for absence was received from Councillor Alan Law.

#### **2. EXCLUSION OF PUBLIC AND PRESS**

2.1 No items were identified where resolutions may be moved to exclude the press and public.

#### **3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

3.1 Councillor Roger Davison declared an interest in the following item:

- A personal interest in Agenda Item No. 7b – Application for planning permission at 72 Banner Cross Road, Sheffield, S11 9HR (Case No. 19/01761/FUL) as a local Ward Member. Councillor Davison declared that he had not given an opinion or declared his position on the application prior to the meeting, therefore would take part in the discussion and voting thereon.

3.2 Councillor Andrew Sangar declared interests in the following items:

- A disclosable pecuniary interest in Agenda Item No. 7c – Change of use of retail shop (use Class A1) to a micro pub (use Class A4) including a retractable awning to shopfront and provision of a seating area at DH Bowyer and Sons, 4 Brooklands Avenue, Sheffield, S10 4GA (Case No. 19/01727/FUL) as the application site was opposite his home. Councillor Sangar left the room and took no part in the discussion or voting thereon.
- A personal interest in Agenda Item No. 7f – Application for planning permission at Milton Street Car Park, Milton Street, Sheffield, S3 7UF (Case No. 18/03849/FUL) as he was chair of an organisation which had a tenancy within Beehive Works, the listed building adjacent to this application, the tenancy of which ended in late 2016. Councillor Sangar declared that he had not given an opinion or declared his position on the application prior to the meeting, therefore would take part in the discussion and voting thereon.

#### **4. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

- 4.1 The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 6<sup>th</sup> August 2019 were approved as a correct record, subject to paragraph 3.1 being amended as follows, in order to clarify the reason for Councillor Sangar's declaration of interest:

*Councillor Andrew Sangar declared a personal interest in Agenda Item No. 7b – application for planning permission at Milton Street Car Park, Milton Street, Sheffield, S3 7UF (Case No. 18/03849/FUL), for the reason that he was chair of an organisation which had a tenancy within Beehive Works, the listed building adjacent to this application, the tenancy of which ended in late 2016.*

#### **5. SITE VISIT**

- 5.1 **RESOLVED:** That the Chief Planning Officer, in liaison with a Co-Chair, be authorised to make any arrangements for a site visit, in connection with any planning applications requiring a visit by Members, prior to the next meeting of the Committee.

#### **6. APPLICATIONS UNDER VARIOUS ACTS/REGULATIONS**

##### **6a. SHEFFIELD HIGH SCHOOL FOR GIRLS, RUTLAND PARK, SHEFFIELD S10 2PB (CASE NO. 19/01954/FUL)**

- 6a.1 **RESOLVED** that having heard a representation in support of the application from the Applicant, an application for planning permission be granted, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report now submitted, to allow the use of the sports halls and ancillary facilities by clubs and community organisations between 0800 hours and 2200 hours (Mondays to Fridays) and between 0800 hours and 1700 hours (Saturdays, and not on Sundays, Bank Holidays or other National Holidays) (Application under Section 73 to vary condition 3 of planning permission 14/03645/FUL – Application to allow the use of the sports halls and ancillary facilities by clubs and community organisations between 0800 hours and 2030 hours (Mondays to Fridays) and between 0800 hours and 1700 hours (Saturdays, and not on Sundays, Bank Holidays or other National Holidays) and in accordance with the Sports Hall Lettings Management Plan. Application under Section 73 to vary conditions 2 and 3 of planning permission 97/00714/FUL formerly 97/0329P – Erection of sports hall and ancillary facilities in accordance with the amended plans, at Sheffield High School for Girls, Rutland Park, Sheffield, S10 2PB (Case No. 19/01954/FUL).

##### **6b. 72 BANNER CROSS ROAD, SHEFFIELD S11 9HR (CASE NO. 19/01761/FUL)**

- 6b.1 **RESOLVED** that having heard a representations against the application from two members of the public and a representation in support of the application from the Agent, an application for planning permission be granted, conditionally, for the

reasons set out in the report now submitted, for the erection of a single storey rear extension and erection of a rear raised patio area at 72 Banner Cross Road, Sheffield, S11 9HR (Case No. 19/01761/FUL).

(NOTE: Prior to the passing of the above resolution, an alternative motion, moved by Councillor Roger Davison, that the application be deferred pending a site visit was put to the vote and lost).

**6c. D H BOWYER AND SONS, 4 BROOKLANDS AVENUE, SHEFFIELD S10 4GA (CASE NO. 19/01727/FUL)**

6c.1 Councillor Andrew Sangar left the room prior to this item and took no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

6c.2 Further representations and an additional condition were detailed in the supplementary report circulated at the meeting.

6c.3 **RESOLVED** that having heard a representation against the application from a member of the public and representations in support of the application from Councillor Cliff Woodcraft (local Ward Member) and the applicant's representative, an application for planning permission be granted, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report, including the additional condition contained within the Supplementary Report, now submitted, for the change of use of retail shop (use Class A1) to a micro pub (use Class A4) including a retractable awning to shopfront and provision of a seating area at D.H. Bowyer and Sons, 4 Brooklands Avenue, Sheffield, S10 4GA (Case No. 19/01727/FUL).

**6d. PARK HILL ESTATE, DUKE STREET, PARK HILL, SHEFFIELD S2 5RQ (CASE NO. 19/00902/LBC)**

6d.1 **RESOLVED** that having heard a representation in support of the application from the architect of the scheme, an application for listed building consent be granted, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report now submitted, for Park Hill Phase 4 – Refurbishment of Duke Street tower block for a mixed-use development comprising of 95 residential units, education space, artist studios, flexible workspaces, temporary artist accommodations and heritage flats and an extension to form a new purpose-built art gallery with ancillary shop and café, landscaping, car parking and associated works (use classes B1, C3 and D1) at Park Hill Estate, Duke Street, Park Hill, Sheffield, S2 5RQ (Case No. 19/00902/LBC).

**6e. PARK HILL ESTATE, DUKE STREET, PARK HILL, SHEFFIELD S2 5RQ (CASE NO. 19/00523/FUL)**

6e.1 **RESOLVED** that having heard a representation in support of the application from the architect of the scheme, an application for planning permission be granted, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report now submitted, for Park Hill

Phase 4 – Refurbishment of Duke Street tower block for a mixed-use development comprising of 95 residential units, education space, artist studios, flexible workspaces, temporary artist accommodations and heritage flats and an extension to form a new purpose-built art gallery with ancillary shop and café, landscaping, car parking and associated works (use classes B1, C3 and D1) at Park Hill Estate, Duke Street, Park Hill, Sheffield, S2 5RQ (Case No. 19/00523/FUL).

**6f. MILTON STREET CAR PARK, MILTON STREET, SHEFFIELD S3 7UF (CASE NO. 18/03849/FUL)**

6f.1 Updated advice from Historic England along with the Officer response and a revised condition, were included within the Supplementary Report circulated at the meeting.

6f.2 The application had been deferred at the previous meeting to allow a second viability assessment to be conducted by an independent valuer/expert. The second viability assessment had also concluded that the scheme could not deliver any contribution towards affordable housing provision.

6f.3 **RESOLVED** that having heard a representation in support of the application from the Agent, an application for planning permission be granted, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report, now submitted, and including the revised condition, as set out in the Supplementary Report, now submitted, for demolition of existing structures and erection of a mixed use development between 4 to 26 storeys with 372 residential apartments including 5 live work units, retail/commercial floorspace (A1 with no more than 225sqm of floorspace A2/A3/A4/B1 use class) at ground floor, ancillary facilities, amenity space and associated parking (as amended plans) at Milton Street Car Park, Milton Street, Sheffield, S3 7UF (Case No. 18/03849/FUL).

**6g. LAND AT HORNDEAN ROAD AND BARNSELY ROAD, SHEFFIELD S5 6UJ (CASE NO. 18/03406/FUL)**

6g.1 An amended condition was detailed within the Supplementary Report circulated at the meeting.

6g.2 **RESOLVED** that having heard representations against the application from Councillor Mark Jones (Local Ward Member) and a member of the public and a representation in support of the application from the Agent, an application for planning permission be granted, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report, now submitted, and including the amended condition contained within the Supplementary Report, now submitted, for the erection of 19 apartments in 1 x 3/4-storey block with associated landscaping and provision of car parking (Resubmissions of planning permission 17/04555/FUL) (Amended Plans received 9<sup>th</sup> July 2019) at Land at Horndean Road and Barnsley Road, Sheffield, S5 6UJ (Case No. 18/34036/FUL).

**7. RECORD OF PLANNING APPEAL SUBMISSIONS AND DECISIONS**

- 7.1 The Committee received and noted a report of the Chief Planning Officer detailing new planning appeals received and appeals dismissed and allowed by the Secretary of State along with a summary of the reasons given.
- 7.2 The Committee's attention was drawn to an appeal dismissed by the Secretary of State at 104 Page Hall Road, Sheffield, S4 8GW. In this instance, the Secretary of State had agreed with the Council's view that to allow the application would undermine the residential character of the street.

**8. DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

- 8.1 It was noted that the next meeting of the Committee would be held at 2.00pm on Tuesday 17<sup>th</sup> September 2019 at the Town Hall.